

**BUKTI KORESPONDENSI**  
**ARTIKEL JURNAL INTERNASIONAL BEREPUTASI**

Judul artikel	:	“The moderating effect of competitive intensity on foresight capability and product innovation of SMEs in Indonesia
Jurnal	:	Problems and Perspectives in Management
Penulis	:	Vigory Gloriman Manalu Siti Nurhayati Refius Pradipta Setyanto

No.	Perihal	Tanggal
1	Submit manuscript	19/08/2022
2	Revisi pertama (desk review)	30/08/2022
3	Revisi kedua (editor review) dan cek Plagiarism	16/09/2022
4	Blind review pertama	28/10/2022
5	Blind review kedua	11/01/2023
6	Blind review ketiga	26/01/2023
7	Selesai tahap review dan keputusan publish	31/01/2023
8	Persetujuan publikasi	01/02/2023
9	Bukti proof-reader sebelum publish	08/02/2023
10	Bukti publish (link artikel)	13/02/2023



---

## MA6507: Your manuscript has been submitted

1 message

---

**Manuscript Administration System** <noreply@manuscript-adminsystem.com>

Fri, Aug 19, 2022 at 9:14 PM

To: vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id

Dear Vigory Gloriman Manalu,

Vigory Gloriman Manalu has submitted the manuscript HOW FORESIGHT CAPABILITIES INFLUENCE PRODUCT INNOVATION PERFORMANCE OF SME IN INDONESIA: COMPETITIVE INTENSITY AS MODERATION to Problems and Perspectives in Management on 19.08.2022.

Submission form contains the following details:

Journal: Problems and Perspectives in Management

Manuscript title: HOW FORESIGHT CAPABILITIES INFLUENCE PRODUCT INNOVATION PERFORMANCE OF SME IN INDONESIA: COMPETITIVE INTENSITY AS MODERATION

### Authors Information

Author - Correspondent

First Name: Vigory Gloriman

Last Name: Manalu

Position

Degree: Ph.D. Candidate and First author

Faculty: Economics and Business

Department: Management

University: Jenderal Soedirman University

Business Address

Postal university address

City: Banyumas, Country: ID

Personal university web page: <https://scholar.google.co.id/citations?user=WG8J2bQAAAAJ&hl=id>

Email: [vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id](mailto:vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id)

IDs

ORCID: N/A

Researcher ID: N/A

Co-authors

Co-Author's First Name: Siti

Co-Author's Last Name: Nurhayati

Co-Author's University: Pekalongan University

Co-Author's Faculty: Economics and Business

Co-Author's Department: Management

Co-Author's Degree: Professor and Second Author

Co-Author's Email: [nurhayati.ms99@gmail.com](mailto:nurhayati.ms99@gmail.com)

Co-Author's ORCID: N/A

Co-Author's Researcher ID: N/A

Co-Author's First Name: Refius Pradipta

Co-Author's Last Name: Setyanto

Co-Author's University: Jenderal Soedirman University

Co-Author's Faculty: Economics and Business

Co-Author's Department: Management

Co-Author's Degree: Associate Professor and Third Author

Co-Author's Email: [refius.setyanto@unsoed.ac.id](mailto:refius.setyanto@unsoed.ac.id)

Co-Author's ORCID: N/A

Co-Author's Researcher ID: N/A

Kind regards,

undefined



## MA6507: Notification on Submission

3 messages

k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com <k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com>

Tue, Aug 30, 2022 at 11:35 PM

To: vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id

Dear Vigory Gloriman Manalu,

the manuscript HOW FORESIGHT CAPABILITIES INFLUENCE PRODUCT INNOVATION PERFORMANCE OF SME IN INDONESIA: COMPETITIVE INTENSITY AS MODERATION, submitted to Problems and Perspectives in Management Journal, needs to be revised.

### Comments:

We ask you to align the manuscript following the Guidelines <https://businessperspectives.org/journals/problems-and-perspectives-in-management#submission-guidelines-for-authors>

Please, pay attention that the research paper, which is a final report on the finished original experimental study, the structure is Abstract, Introduction, Literature review, Method, Results, Discussion, Conclusion.

Carefully divide text between sections. Do not divide sections into small subsections and do not involve additional sections.

The number of words in the paper may vary from 4000 to 6000. Considering the issue concerning the calculation of the number of words in the paper, the information about the authors, title, abstract and keywords, list of references and appendix (up to 5 pages) should not be included.

Clearly and concretely state the aim of the study and the title.

Write the Abstract according to the following algorithm: first two or three sentences indicate the relevance of the topic; the aim and object of the study; the methodology (methods) of the study (for theoretical studies – its theoretical basis) are described; the obtained results and their practical value are characterized. Dedicate most of the Abstract to the result. While demonstrating it, provide quantitative characteristics. The volume of the Abstract should be 150-250 words.

The keywords should reflect the area of the research. The number of keywords should be 5-10 in average. There should not be the sentences, but the words or word groups. There is no need to replicate words from the title of the manuscript.

Clarify JEL classification codes.

The Introduction (0,5-1 page) should be devoted exclusively to the relevance of the research topic and the formulation of the problem in general. Do not review the literature here.

The Literature review (40-50 analyzed sources) should begin with a few introductory sentences. It should also be completed with 2-3 general sentences. Then authors should complete it by formulating the Aim. Then provide hypotheses (right here and altogether, do not place the text between them). Then should be Methods.

The Result section is the main section of the article.

The Discussion section should discuss the study results, compare them with previous ones, discuss why the authors have such results, determine future prospects.

The Conclusions were built incorrectly. There should be such logic in the Conclusions - indicate the aim of the research, briefly demonstrate the result, indicate what conclusions should be drawn from it.

Please, carefully revise the manuscript's text to ensure it's academic and logical.

The deadline for revisions is 2022-09-06

To revise a manuscript please don't forget to log in to the system and to upload a revised manuscript!

Kind regards,

Katerina Maschenko  
Managing Editor  
Journal Problems and Perspectives in Management

Dear Managing Editor,

I have submitted the revised manuscript to the system.

Warmest regards,  
Vigory Goriman Manalu  
(Author)

[Quoted text hidden]

--

**Mr. Vigory Gloriman Manalu**

Faculty of Economics, University of Kuningan

---

**k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com** <k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com>  
To: Vigory Gloriman Manalu <vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id>

Tue, Sep 6, 2022 at 3:29 AM

Dear Vigory Gloriman Manalu,

I am writing to acknowledge the receipt of the revised version from you.

We will provide you with further information.

Have a nice day!

Sincerely yours,

Katerina

**Managing Editor | International Research Journal | LLC “CPC “Business Perspectives”**

[k.maschenko@businessperspectives.org](mailto:k.maschenko@businessperspectives.org) | [https://businessperspectives.org/journals/problems-and-perspectives-in-management?category\\_id=30](https://businessperspectives.org/journals/problems-and-perspectives-in-management?category_id=30) | <http://www.businessperspectives.org>

Follow us on **Twitter**: [https://twitter.com/LLC\\_BP](https://twitter.com/LLC_BP)

Follow us on **LinkedIn**: <https://www.linkedin.com/company/business-perspectives/>

---

**Від:** Vigory Gloriman Manalu <vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id>

**Надіслано:** 3 вересня 2022 р. 16:13

**Кому:** [k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com](mailto:k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com)

**Тема:** Re: MA6507: Notification on Submission

[Quoted text hidden]

Universitas Kuningan

<https://uniku.ac.id>

“Pada tahun 2032 Menjadi Universitas Unggul yang Memiliki Komitmen Tinggi terhadap Pemberdayaan Masyarakat”.



## MA6507: Notification on Submission

1 message

**k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com** <k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com>  
To: vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id

Fri, Sep 16, 2022 at 3:36 PM

Dear Vigory Gloriman Manalu,

the manuscript HOW FORESIGHT CAPABILITIES INFLUENCE PRODUCT INNOVATION PERFORMANCE OF SME IN INDONESIA: COMPETITIVE INTENSITY AS MODERATION, submitted to Problems and Perspectives in Management Journal, needs to be revised.

### Comments:

The text of the manuscript should not be submitted in the first person, not like “we”, “authors” or “researchers”.

Specify the title. In fact, we currently have two questions in the title that the authors want to demonstrate.

This also applies to the purpose of the study. It should be one.

The keywords should reflect the area of the research. The number of keywords should be 5-10 in average. There should not be the sentences, but the words or word groups. There is no need to replicate words from the title of the manuscript.

Do not enter or use your own (unestablished) abbreviations in the title of the article, in the Abstract, in the Conclusions.

Write the abstract carefully and more responsibly. Provide quantitative indicators while demonstrating the result of the study.

Do not start chapters with subsections. Introductory sentences are required.

There should be 40-50 analyzed sources in the literature review. It should start with a few introductory sentences. The review should also be concluded with 2-3 summarizing sentences. Then the purpose of the research should be formulated.

Our journal strictly observes the principles of publication ethics, including when talking about citing the works of other scientists and the works they published earlier. Any loanwords, including text loans (even insignificant), are unacceptable without mentioning their author.

We kindly ask you to pay attention to the widespread problem of wrong citation when Author A somehow gives (mentions, retells) the text fragment from the work (published by Author B), which contains the reference to other work (published by Author C).

In this case there are two options of correct citation:

1 – cite the work of Author B and note that he/she, in turn, cited the work of Author C;

2 – directly mention the work of Author C as well and cite it.

Do not forget that you can also use direct citations, that is why please use the quotation marks and when citing the source please note the page from which this quotation was taken.

You should be absolutely sure that you did not violate the principles of publication ethics. If there are at least small doubts that there can be loanwords in your text, we kindly ask you to check the manuscript for plagiarism by yourself using the special instruments (plagiarism detection software).

Please, check the plagiarism report and revise the manuscript

<https://drive.google.com/file/d/18JAQxVqLuCVwgbfHbnrp05KPSBxbWJAI/view?usp=sharing>

The deadline for revisions is 2022-09-22

To revise a manuscript please don't forget to log in to the system and to upload a revised manuscript!

Kind regards,

Katerina Maschenko  
Managing Editor  
Journal Problems and Perspectives in Management



---

## MA6507: Notification on Submission

1 message

---

**k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com** <k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com>

Fri, Oct 28, 2022 at 3:14 PM

To: vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id

Dear Vigory Gloriman Manalu,

the manuscript HOW FORESIGHT CAPABILITIES INFLUENCE PRODUCT INNOVATION PERFORMANCE OF SME IN INDONESIA: COMPETITIVE INTENSITY AS MODERATION, submitted to Problems and Perspectives in Management Journal, needs to be revised.

### Comments:

We emphasize the formal requirements and the need to comply with them. Please, check and comply with the previous comments.

Please, study each sentence carefully, each paragraph, and the entire text of the manuscript as a whole. Clearly define the purpose of the research and subordinate the entire paper to it.

The deadline for revisions is 2022-11-03

To revise a manuscript please don't forget to log in to the system and to upload a revised manuscript!

Kind regards,

Katerina Maschenko  
Managing Editor  
Journal Problems and Perspectives in Management





## MA6507: Notification on Submission

1 message

k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com <k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com>

Wed, Jan 11, 2023 at 11:34  
PM

To: vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id

Dear Vigory Gloriman Manalu,

the manuscript HOW FORESIGHT CAPABILITIES INFLUENCE PRODUCT INNOVATION PERFORMANCE OF SME IN INDONESIA: COMPETITIVE INTENSITY AS MODERATION, submitted to Problems and Perspectives in Management Journal, needs to be revised.

### Comments:

The title of the article and its aim do not match.

In the abstract, indicate who exactly was interviewed, from which industries, how they were interviewed, why such a sample (all this should also be explained in the abstract while demonstrating the result), and how relevant it is.

Most of the text of the manuscript looks very chaotic. Why, for example, such a paragraph in the Introduction "In order to compete, companies are required to have good foresight to be able to predict future events (Nyuur, Brečić, & Sobiesuo, 2015; Vecchiato, Favato, Di Maddaloni, & Do, 2020). Foresight is a more inclusive capacity to creatively absorb and synthesize important information into meaningful future-oriented knowledge to thrive, develop, and perhaps create and capture sustainable value (Paliokaitė, Pačėsa, & Sarpong, 2014)." Where is the logic here? What does it demonstrate? Why is foresight in general devoted so much attention here in the Introduction? For what?

Better to remove this altogether "This study will investigate how foresight can affect product innovation performance and the moderating effect of competitive intensity.

This study aims to provide insight to owners or managers and policy stakeholders on the survival and resilience of SMEs in facing the intensity of business competition by focusing on the role of product innovation which is thought to be influenced by foresight capabilities. This paper will use various predetermined characteristics of SMEs from West Java, Indonesia. Next, this paper will provide the literature review, explain the research methodology and present the empirical results. It will then conclude with a discussion of the findings and limitations and offer some suggestions for future research. "

The introduction should be devoted only to explaining the relevance of the research topic and at its conclusion to formulate a SCIENTIFIC problem (not an aim, but a problem). The purpose of the research should be indicated after completing the Literature Review. The review should be devoted to previous studies on the specific issue that the authors are investigating.

Follow all other recommendations.

The deadline for revisions is 2023-01-18

To revise a manuscript please don't forget to log in to the system and to upload a revised manuscript!

Kind regards,

Katerina Maschenko  
Managing Editor  
Journal Problems and Perspectives in Management



---

## MA6507: Notification on Submission

1 message

---

**k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com** <k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com>

Thu, Jan 26, 2023 at 7:50  
PM

To: vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id

Dear Vigory Gloriman Manalu,

the manuscript HOW FORESIGHT CAPABILITIES INFLUENCE PRODUCT INNOVATION PERFORMANCE OF SME IN INDONESIA: COMPETITIVE INTENSITY AS MODERATION, submitted to Problems and Perspectives in Management Journal, needs to be revised.

### Comments:

Once again, please carefully read and process the text.

For example, the title of the article should be agreed upon. The aim should be the same or very similar throughout the text of the manuscript. All sections should be subordinated to the realization of the aim.

The deadline for revisions is 2023-02-02

To revise a manuscript please don't forget to log in to the system and to upload a revised manuscript!

Kind regards,

Katerina Maschenko  
Managing Editor  
Journal Problems and Perspectives in Management



---

## MA6507: Notification on Submission

2 messages

---

**k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com** <k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com>

Tue, Jan 31, 2023 at 9:31  
PM

To: vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id

Dear Vigory Gloriman Manalu,

The submitted manuscript HOW FORESIGHT CAPABILITIES INFLUENCE PRODUCT INNOVATION PERFORMANCE OF SME IN INDONESIA: COMPETITIVE INTENSITY AS MODERATION to Problems and Perspectives in Management Journal has passed the review process and is waiting for your decision regarding the publishing.

Please log in to the system to start or decline the publishing process.

Thanks.

Kind regards,

Katerina Maschenko  
Managing Editor  
Journal Problems and Perspectives in Management

---

**Vigory Gloriman Manalu** <vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id>  
To: k.maschenko@manuscript-adminsystem.com

Tue, Jan 31, 2023 at 9:45 PM

Dear Katerina Maschenko,

Thank you for the information. I have logged in to the system and decided to start the publishing process.

Kind regards,

[Quoted text hidden]

--

**Mr. Vigory Gloriman Manalu**

Faculty of Economics, University of Kuningan



## MA6507: Manuscript is Agreed for Publication

1 message

**Manuscript Administration System** <noreply@manuscript-adminsystem.com>

Wed, Feb 1, 2023 at 9:01 PM

To: vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id

Dear Vigory Gloriman Manalu,

The manuscript HOW FORESIGHT CAPABILITIES INFLUENCE PRODUCT INNOVATION PERFORMANCE OF SME IN INDONESIA: COMPETITIVE INTENSITY AS MODERATION submitted to Problems and Perspectives in Management is agreed for publication on 01.02.2023

The data about the author is below:

Author's First Name: Vigory Gloriman

Author's Last Name: Manalu

University country: ID

University city: Banyumas

University email: [vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id](mailto:vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id)

The data about co-authors is below:

Co-Author's First Name: Siti

Co-Author's Last Name: Nurhayati

Co-Author's University: Pekalongan University

Co-Author's Faculty: Economics and Business

Co-Author's Department: Management

Co-Author's Degree: Professor and Second Author

Co-Author's Email: [nurhayati.ms99@gmail.com](mailto:nurhayati.ms99@gmail.com)

Co-Author's ORCID: N/A

Co-Author's Researcher ID: N/A

Co-Author's First Name: Refius Pradipta

Co-Author's Last Name: Setyanto

Co-Author's University: Jenderal Soedirman University

Co-Author's Faculty: Economics and Business

Co-Author's Department: Management

Co-Author's Degree: Associate Professor and Third Author

Co-Author's Email: [refius.setyanto@unsoed.ac.id](mailto:refius.setyanto@unsoed.ac.id)

Co-Author's ORCID: N/A

Co-Author's Researcher ID: N/A

Managing Editor/Publisher Coordinator of Problems and Perspectives in Management Journal will contact you soon and provide with further information (Acceptance letter, Publication Agreement and Copyright & Licensing).

Kind regards,

undefined



---

## MA6507 comments

2 messages

---

**k.maschenko@businessperspectives.org** <k.maschenko@businessperspectives.org>  
To: vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id

Wed, Feb 8, 2023 at 2:17 PM

Dear Vigory Gloriman Manalu,

Hope this letter finds you well.

Attached you will find the additional comments of a proof-reader in the text of a paper.

Pay attention to the marked words and check these corrections and revise if required.

Please, do ONLY the required changes in the attached file within 2 days and highlight all changes that you make. Please, indicate DOI or another link to the source that/if you add.

We will prepare this manuscript for publication.

Look forward to hearing from you.

Sincerely yours,

Katerina

**Managing Editor | International Research Journal | LLC “CPC “Business Perspectives”**

[k.maschenko@businessperspectives.org](mailto:k.maschenko@businessperspectives.org) | [https://businessperspectives.org/journals/problems-and-perspectives-in-management?category\\_id=30](https://businessperspectives.org/journals/problems-and-perspectives-in-management?category_id=30) | <http://www.businessperspectives.org>

Follow us on **Twitter**: [https://twitter.com/LLC\\_BP](https://twitter.com/LLC_BP)

Follow us on **LinkedIn**: <https://www.linkedin.com/company/business-perspectives/>



**ppm\_MA6507\_to authors.docx**  
73K

---

**Vigory Gloriman Manalu** <vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id>  
To: k.maschenko@businessperspectives.org

Thu, Feb 9, 2023 at 9:54 AM

Dear Katerina Maschenko,

Hereby I attach the latest revision. I highlight my revision with blue color.

Kind regards,  
Vigory Gloriman Manalu  
Author

[Quoted text hidden]

--

**Mr. Vigory Gloriman Manalu**

Faculty of Economics, University of Kuningan

---



**Proofread\_ppm\_MA6507\_to authors.docx**

77K



---

## MA6507 published

2 messages

---

**k.maschenko@businessperspectives.org** <k.maschenko@businessperspectives.org>

Mon, Feb 13, 2023 at 7:07  
PM

To: vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id

Cc: nurhayati.ms99@gmail.com, refius.setyanto@unsoed.ac.id

Dear authors,

Hope you are doing well!

Your article "The moderating effect of competitive intensity on foresight capability and product innovation of SMEs in Indonesia" has been published.

Here is the link to the article: [http://dx.doi.org/10.21511/ppm.21\(1\).2023.19](http://dx.doi.org/10.21511/ppm.21(1).2023.19)

It is also posted in LinkedIn and Twitter:

[https://twitter.com/PPM\\_Journal/status/1623956997535145984?s=20&t=mPjAooObqDlyJgNForeolw](https://twitter.com/PPM_Journal/status/1623956997535145984?s=20&t=mPjAooObqDlyJgNForeolw)

[https://www.linkedin.com/posts/journal-problems-and-perspectives-in-management\\_smeinnovation-smecompetition-smeforesight-activity-7029722468068032512-UtH6?utm\\_source=share&utm\\_medium=member\\_desktop](https://www.linkedin.com/posts/journal-problems-and-perspectives-in-management_smeinnovation-smecompetition-smeforesight-activity-7029722468068032512-UtH6?utm_source=share&utm_medium=member_desktop)

For your personal and article's promotion, we recommend you upload your paper on IDEAS, SSRN, ResearchGate etc., for improvement the citation and for possibility to find potential co-authors and readers for your future publications.

We encourage you to share information about the published paper with your colleagues (via e-mail or share article in Twitter and LinkedIn). You may send out press releases to local media, and publish internal newsletters. It's a good idea to post information about preliminary calculations and research at figshare <https://figshare.com/>

We highly recommend you create a Publons, ResearcherID, ORCID, and complete them, that helps you to promote yourself as an author and a reviewer, also helps to find potential co-authors and readers for your publications, gives more experience on editorship.

You can read more how to promote your paper here: <https://businessperspectives.org/article-promotion>

Please, pay attention that you are obliged to indicate weblink to the journal.

We will be grateful for your help in promoting your article and our journal in general at your university and through other possible communication channels.

Wish you all the best!

With kind regards,

Katerina



Follow us on **Twitter**: [https://twitter.com/LLC\\_BP](https://twitter.com/LLC_BP)

Follow us on **LinkedIn**: <https://www.linkedin.com/company/business-perspectives/>

---

**Vigory Gloriman Manalu** <[vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id](mailto:vigoryglo@uniku.ac.id)>  
Draft To: [k.maschenko@businessperspectives.org](mailto:k.maschenko@businessperspectives.org)  
Cc: [nurhayati.ms99@gmail.com](mailto:nurhayati.ms99@gmail.com), [refius.setyanto@unsoed.ac.id](mailto:refius.setyanto@unsoed.ac.id)

Tue, Feb 14, 2023 at 11:32 AM

Thank you for the information.

[Quoted text hidden]

--

**Mr. Vigory Gloriman Manalu**

Faculty of Economics, University of Kuningan